
Prothero God Is Not One

Prothero God Is Not One

Downloaded from
evoluir.abar.org.br by
Osborn & Hope

INTRODUCTION: RETHINKING RELIGIOUS UNITY IN A DIVERSE WORLD

In an era that often emphasizes tolerance and harmony, the prevailing sentiment among many spiritual seekers and interfaith advocates is that all religions essentially teach the same thing. The popular bumper sticker mantra "God is love" or the idea that different faiths are merely different paths up the same mountain has become a comforting thought. However, one of the most provocative and influential voices in contemporary religious studies challenges this notion head-on. In his landmark work, **Stephen Prothero's *God Is Not One*** presents a compelling and controversial argument: that the world's major religions are fundamentally different, that these differences matter deeply, and that pretending otherwise does a disservice to both believers and seekers of truth.

Published in 2010, *God Is Not One: The Eight Rival Religions That Run the World—and Why Their Differences Matter* quickly became a touchstone for discussions about comparative religion, interfaith dialogue, and global cultural literacy. This article will explore Prothero's core thesis, examine the eight religions he profiles, and discuss why his argument remains incredibly relevant for understanding our interconnected—and often conflicted—world. We will delve

into the key insights from **Prothero God Is Not One**, unpacking the nuances of his approach and considering both the praise and criticism his work has received.

WHO IS STEPHEN PROTHERO? THE SCHOLAR BEHIND THE THESIS

Before diving into the book itself, it is important to understand the background of its author. Stephen Prothero is a professor of religion at Boston University, a department he once chaired. He is a renowned scholar of American religion, East Asian religions, and comparative theology. Prothero is not a polemicist seeking to dismiss religion; rather, he is a serious academic who has written extensively on the role of faith in public life. His previous works include *American Jesus: How the Son of God Became a National Icon* and *Religious Literacy: What Every American Needs to Know—And Doesn't*.

Prothero's concern, as expressed in *Religious Literacy*, is that Americans are profoundly ignorant about the basic tenets of their own faiths, let alone those of other traditions. This ignorance, he argues, is dangerous in a globalized world. **Prothero God Is Not One** emerges directly from this concern. It is not an attack on religion but an urgent call for genuine understanding. He argues that the "all religions are one" approach is actually a form of intellectual laziness that prevents us from grasping the real motivations and worldviews of billions of people. By

insisting on sameness, we fail to see what makes each tradition unique and powerful in the lives of its adherents.

THE CORE THESIS: WHY RELIGIONS ARE NOT THE SAME

The central argument of **Prothero God Is Not One** is elegant in its simplicity and devastating in its implications. Prothero rejects the "perennial philosophy" or "pluralistic hypothesis" popularized by thinkers like Aldous Huxley and, more recently, by authors like Huston Smith. The idea that all religions are different paths up the same mountain is, in Prothero's view, a well-meaning but inaccurate platitude.

Prothero argues that the world's great religions disagree on the most fundamental questions of human existence. They do not share a common goal. Instead, each religion diagnoses a different core problem with the human condition and prescribes a different solution. This framework—problem and solution—is the organizing principle of his book. For example:

- **Christianity** diagnoses the problem as sin, and the solution is salvation through faith in Jesus Christ.
- **Buddhism** diagnoses the problem as suffering (dukkha), caused by craving and attachment, and the solution is the Eightfold Path leading to Nirvana.
- **Islam** diagnoses the problem as pride and self-sufficiency (shirk, or associating partners with God), and the solution is submission (islam) to the will of Allah.
- **Hinduism** diagnoses the problem as ignorance of one's true nature (atman), and the solution is

liberation (moksha) through knowledge and devotion.

Because these diagnoses and solutions are fundamentally different, Prothero argues, we cannot simply paper over the differences with feel-good language about universal love. To do so is to misunderstand each tradition on its own terms. This is the core insight of **Prothero God Is Not One**: genuine respect requires recognizing difference, not erasing it.

THE EIGHT RIVAL RELIGIONS: A TOUR OF THE WORLD'S FAITHS

Prothero profiles eight religious traditions that he argues "run the world." He is careful to note that there are many other traditions, but these eight—due to their historical influence and number of adherents—demand our attention. He devotes a chapter to each, exploring the history, core beliefs, practices, and contemporary challenges of each faith.

Islam: The Way of Submission

Prothero begins with Islam, the world's second-largest religion. He emphasizes its core message of absolute monotheism (tawhid) and the importance of submission to God's will. He explains the Five Pillars, the role of the Quran, the historical split between Sunni and Shia, and the diversity within the tradition. He argues that Islam's central problem is not sin but forgetfulness of God, and its solution is remembrance (dhikr) and submission.

Christianity: The Way of Salvation

Christianity, the world's largest religion, is profiled next. Prothero focuses on the centrality of Jesus Christ—his incarnation, crucifixion, and resurrection—as the solution to the problem of sin. He explores the development of creeds, the splits between Catholicism, Orthodoxy, and Protestantism, and the global spread of Christianity. He highlights the Christian emphasis on faith, grace, and the transformation of the individual.

Buddhism: The Way of Awakening

Prothero presents Buddhism as a tradition focused on the diagnosis of suffering and the path to awakening. He explains the Four Noble Truths, the Eightfold Path, and the differences between Theravada, Mahayana, and Vajrayana traditions. He emphasizes that Buddhism is non-theistic in its classic form, focused more on a diagnosis of the human condition than on a creator God.

Hinduism: The Way of Liberation

Hinduism, with its vast array of gods and philosophies, is presented as a tradition seeking liberation (moksha) from the

cycle of rebirth (samsara). Prothero explains key concepts like karma, dharma, and the different yogas (paths) to liberation—including the path of knowledge (jnana), devotion (bhakti), and action (karma).

Confucianism: The Way of Social Harmony

Often debated as a religion or a philosophy, Prothero includes Confucianism for its profound influence on East Asian societies. He explains its focus on ritual, filial piety, and the cultivation of virtue (ren) as the path to social harmony. The problem Confucianism addresses is social chaos, and the solution is the cultivation of moral exemplars.

Daoism: The Way of Nature

In many ways a counterpoint to Confucianism, Daoism emphasizes living in harmony with the Dao, the natural Way of the universe. Prothero explores the teachings of Laozi, the concept of wu-wei (effortless action), and the focus on simplicity and spontaneity. The problem Daoism addresses is excessive striving and artifice.

Shinto: The Way of the Kami

Prothero profiles Shinto, the indigenous religion of Japan, which focuses on

reverence for the kami (spirits or gods) and the importance of ritual purification and connection to nature. Shinto's problem is impurity, and its solution is purification and harmony with the kami.

Judaism: The Way of the Covenant

Prothero places Judaism last, emphasizing its foundational role for Christianity and Islam. He explains the centrality of the covenant between God and the Jewish people, the importance of Torah, the concepts of exile and return, and the diverse expressions of Judaism—Reform, Conservative, Orthodox, and Reconstructionist. Judaism's problem is exile from God, and its solution is return (teshuvah) through obedience to the covenant.

WHY DIFFERENCES MATTER: THE PRACTICAL IMPLICATIONS

One of the most critical sections of **Prothero God Is Not One** is his explanation of why these differences are not merely academic. Prothero argues that understanding religious differences has profound practical implications for international relations, diplomacy, and conflict resolution. He points out that many of the world's most intractable conflicts—in the Middle East, South Asia, and elsewhere—have a religious dimension that cannot be reduced to economic or political factors.

When policymakers or journalists insist that "all religions teach peace," they are not only being inaccurate but also unhelpful. Prothero argues that we must

understand what specific religious motivations are at play in a given situation. For example, understanding the Islamic concept of jihad, the Hindu concept of dharma yuddha (righteous war), or the Christian concept of just war theory requires far more than a simplistic "religion is peaceful" narrative. Prothero's thesis in **Prothero God Is Not One** is that genuine interfaith dialogue begins not with assumed agreement but with honest acknowledgment of deep disagreement.

He also argues that this approach is more respectful to believers. When we tell a devout Muslim that his faith is essentially the same as a Buddhist's, we are implicitly dismissing the unique claims and practices that make Islam meaningful to him. True respect, Prothero suggests, means taking those claims seriously, even when—especially when—they differ from our own.

CRITIQUES AND RECEPTION OF PROTHERO'S WORK

Like any influential work, **Prothero God Is Not One** has attracted its share of criticism. Some scholars argue that Prothero overstates the differences between religions and underplays the commonalities. Critics in the perennial philosophy camp maintain that at the mystical or esoteric level, all religions do point toward a single transcendent reality. Others argue that Prothero's framework of "problem and solution" is too simplistic and does not do justice to the complexity and internal diversity of each tradition.

Some reviewers have also noted that Prothero's selection of eight religions is somewhat arbitrary. He excludes important traditions like Jainism, Sikhism, Zoroastrianism, and indigenous

religions, which also have global influence. Others have criticized his omission of secular worldviews like humanism or atheism, which also shape global affairs.

Despite these critiques, the book has been widely praised for its clarity, accessibility, and intellectual honesty. Many readers and educators have found it to be a valuable corrective to the often mushy thinking that surrounds discussions of religion. Prothero's willingness to state that religions are "rivals" and that their differences matter has been seen as a refreshing antidote to the "all paths lead to God" sentiment that dominates much popular spirituality.

THE RELEVANCE OF "GOD IS NOT ONE" IN THE 21ST CENTURY

Since its publication, the relevance of

Prothero God Is Not One has only grown. In an age of globalization, mass migration, and digital communication, encounters between different religious traditions are more common than ever before. At the same time, religious extremism, sectarian violence, and the politicization of faith continue to dominate headlines.

Prothero's call for religious literacy is more urgent than ever. In a world where a cartoon of the Prophet Muhammad can spark international protests, where debates about abortion, euthanasia, and religious freedom dominate political discourse, and where millions of people are displaced by religious conflict, the ability to understand the actual beliefs and practices of different faiths is not a luxury but a necessity.

Furthermore, Prothero's argument challenges both the secular left and the religious right